



Ohio Collaborative Community- Police Advisory Board

October 29, 2020 Meeting Summary

The Ohio Collaborative Community Police Advisory Board (Collaborative) is a multidisciplinary group consisting of a diverse group of Ohioans including law enforcement, community members, elected officials, academia and the faith based community. The Collaborative was created by executive order 2015-04k on April 29, 2015, after the Governor's Task Force on Community Police Relations completed its work and produced a report with recommendations on how to improve the important relationship between law enforcement and the communities they serve.

The Collaborative is chaired by Assistant Director Karen Huey, Department of Public Safety. Members appointed by the Governor DeWine, including ex officio members, are identified below:

- Commissioner Lori Barreras— Chair of the Ohio Civil Rights Commission
- Representative Juanita Brent – Ohio Representative
- Dr. Ronnie Dunn—Cleveland State University, Associate Professor of Urban Studies and Interim Chief Diversity and Inclusion Officer
- Dr. Robin S. Engel—University of Cincinnati, Professor of Criminal Justice and Director of IACP/UC Center of Police Research and Policy
- Officer Anthony L. Johnson—Columbus Police Department and member, Fraternal Order of Police
- Sheriff Tom Miller—Medina County Sheriff's Office and member of the Buckeye State Sheriff's Association
- BCI Superintendent Joe Morbitzer— Ohio Attorney General's Office
- Reverend Walter S. Moss— Pastor and CIRV Project Director, Stark County Prosecutor's Office
- The Honorable Ronald J. O'Brien—Franklin County Prosecutor
- Chief Justin Páez—Dublin Police Department and member of the Ohio Association of Chiefs of Police
- Sheriff Rob Streck – Montgomery County Sheriff's Office and member of the Buckeye State Sheriff's Association

Ex officio members:

- Senator Sandra Williams – Ohio Senator
- Representative Phil Plummer – Ohio Representative
- The Honorable Tom Roberts—former Ohio Senator and President, Ohio Conference of Units of NAACP
- The late Honorable Louis Stokes— former member of Congress
- The late Honorable George V. Voinovich—former U.S. Senator, Governor of Ohio, and Mayor of Cleveland

The purpose of the Collaborative is to advise and work with the Office of Criminal Justice Services (OCJS) at the Ohio Department of Public Safety to implement the Task Force's recommendations, as identified in the Executive Order.

October 29, 2020 Virtual Meeting of the Ohio Collaborative Community-Police Advisory Board

Due to Coronavirus, the Ohio Collaborative meeting October 29, 2020 was again held virtually using Microsoft TEAMS Live. The following members were present at the meeting:

- Assistant Director Karen Huey, Chair
- Executive Director Karhlton Moore
- Commissioner Lori Barreras
- Representative Juanita Brent
- Dr. Ronnie Dunn
- Dr. Robin S. Engel
- Officer Anthony Johnson
- Sheriff Tom Miller
- BCI Supt Joe Morbitzer
- Rev. Walter Moss
- Chief Justin Páez
- Representative Phil Plummer
- Sheriff Rob Streck
- Senator Sandra Williams
- Special guest: Chief William Balling, Sidney Police Department and President of OACP.

Opening Remarks

- Assistant Director Karen Huey convened the meeting and provided welcoming remarks.
 - Assistant Director Huey congratulated Officer Johnson and Rev. Walter Moss for reappointment to the board.
 - Assistant Director Huey reviewed the agenda.
 - Mass gathering—propose for adoption
 - Wellness standard—presentation from Chief Balling, President of OACP
 - Assistant Director Huey stated that Governor DeWine has asked us to work on law enforcement response to mass gatherings. She reviewed the number of demonstrations—about 700 from May 25-Sep 25 that were publicized and that DPS were asked to assist with.
 - 72% related to social injustice
 - The rest were election/political, COVID, imprisonment, HT, and pro/against Law Enforcement.
 - Most of the demonstrations were peaceful. There was a spike at the end of May, June, and into beginning of July.
 - This will be the 3rd meeting to discuss mass gatherings. We have brought people of different perspectives to talk to this group.
 - Chief McKinney recently became the chief of the Troy P.D. over the summer. He provided a lot of context for the police department's actions during the protest. Karen apologized to the chief because his department was put in a defensive position. Truly the intent was not to be fact-finders, but to get perspective on

the events of the protest. The chief was offered an opportunity to speak to this group, but he felt it was best to look forward.

- **Late breaking news**—Department of Justice (DOJ) and President Trump issued an Executive Order in June on safe policing and on certifying Law Enforcement. OCJS will serve as the credentialing body.
- Turned it over to Karhlton Moore to discuss the Executive Order and the Mass Gathering standard.
- Karhlton Moore reviewed the background of the Executive Order.
 - In June 2020, Executive Order 13929 on Safe Policing for Safe Communities to ensure Law Enforcement agencies continue to be transparent and ensure safety of the community
 - In Ohio, OCJS has been identified as the credentialing body.
 - Two standards - Have to certify that Law Enforcement are in compliance with:
 - Use of Force
 - Prohibition of chokeholds. We do not yet have this in our standard. Prohibits chokeholds unless in situations which allow for deadly force
 - Certification will affect Department of Justice discretionary grant funding.
 - Law Enforcement are required to submit to us by Jan 31, 2021 evidence that they are in compliance.

Mass Gathering Standard

- Karhlton Moore gave an overview of the draft of the Mass Gathering standard.
 - Karhlton apologized for the delay in sending this standard, but stated that this draft took a lot of time, had to take a lot of perspectives into consideration, including those of collaborative members, Commission on Accreditation for Law Enforcement Agencies (CALEA), and our guest speakers.
 - He thanked the certification team, policy and research, administrative section for their efforts on developing this standard. They provided much information, including the history of responses from the 1960s to today.
 - We looked at the Dublin PD's policy, CALEA standards, and reviewed presentations from Kent State University Police Department Chief Tondiglia and Dr. Herold, as well as received comments from Dr Engel and Senator Williams.
 - Dr. Herold talked about working toward what we want to achieve, not avoid;
 - RDFC (Reasonable Disarming Focused Consistent) model is referenced.
 - OCJS received a lot of input from Law Enforcement on issues of training, from protesters (positive and negative).
 - The Collaborative standards are written as follows:
 - Purpose — What is the desired outcome?
 - Standard — The items listed under the standard are the required elements of the standard. An agency's policy needs to address every element of the standard.
 - Commentary — These are the other things that agencies need to think consider. They are not a required part of an agency's policy. For the Mass Gathering standard, there could have been a lot more commentary.

Comments/Questions on the Standard

- Officer Anthony Johnson had two suggested changes.
 - 2nd paragraph LE shall attempt to discover the intent
 - In 3rd paragraph 'have officers make a soft approach when applicable'
- Chief Justin Páez:
 - He thanked OCJS for the work the office has done putting this together
 - The purpose statement very well written and takes into consideration the constitutional rights while also balancing them with public safety and safety of officers.
 - Chief Páez wanted to know what 'authority for deployment of services' mean?
 - Ed Burkhammer stated that there are lots of resources outside of Law Enforcement resources. This could fall under Incident Command.
 - Karhlton Moore suggested that this be moved under the commentary.
 - Chief Páez suggested that the standard had too many bullets and needed to be simplified.
 - Karhlton Moore agreed that we could condense the bullets, as many fall under Incident Command.
 - Chief Páez wanted to talk about the bullet 'have a communication plan with the media'. He agreed this is important, but the back end of the bullet talks about the inclusion of social media. Chief Páez stated that it almost looks prescriptive, like agencies have to use social media. Some smaller agencies don't have the capacity.
 - Karhlton Moore agreed that social media should not be required.
 - Assistant Director Huey suggested it as a possible resource.
 - Dr. Engel completely agreed about the small agencies issue. One of the chiefs during a talk she attended noted that how their agency failed by not making use of social media.
 - It should be considered as part of the communication plan. Communication has changed and we need to consider these new methods.
 - Discussion of last bullet—"joint training should be conducted"—Chief Páez stated that if required make it a part of the bullet; if it is just recommended then it should be in the commentary.
 - Karhlton Moore wanted to know the feasibility of requiring it.
 - Chief Páez agreed that since joint training is very difficult to do, it should be in the commentary.
 - Senator Williams had a question: If you were to call in an agency for help at the last minute, how do you know what the protocols are if you are an assisting agency?
 - Chief Páez stated that there is regular cooperation with adjoining agencies. Having that incident command system to manage everyone to make sure we are all on the same page.
 - Assistant Director Huey suggested that we could break this into two separate bullets. Recommended joint training should be conducted with responding agencies. Or should this be moved to the commentary?
 - Ed Burkhammer noted that this wording came from the International Association of Chiefs of Police (IACP) and Police Executive Research

Forum (PERF). 'Should' was used to avoid making it a requirement since training is very expensive and difficult.

- Move this point to the commentary? Assistant Director Huey stated that joint training can look very different and we are looking at a standard that could cover so many scenarios.
- Karhlton Moore —What about Senator Williams' point that all the responding agencies need to be on the same page when assisting with a mass demonstration.
- Chief Páez agreed that is important to have an operational briefing/meeting with the participating agencies.
- Senator Williams – When should a responding agency be brought in to help a lead agency with a demonstration? Senator Williams has spoken to several suburban police departments, who were asked to assist the Cleveland PD with a demonstration this summer, but they were brought in too late to help.
- Chief Páez provided his experience with providing assistance to other agencies.
- Officer Johnson—During the RNC in Cleveland, Officers were bussed to a meeting location and expectations were discussed before they ever hit the street. This is common practice to do and often falls within the Incident Command system.
- Sheriff Streck—Distinction between spontaneous vs planned demonstrations. There is a lot to consider. Can we have time to consider these elements of the standard?
- We will have to take this to another meeting. Please share your thoughts on this ASAP.
 - Rep. Brent—jumping back to operations – If the State is requiring training, the municipalities should not be responsible, rather the State should pay for the training.
 - Rep. Brent—Social media should be mandatory.
- Assistant Director Huey—any more comments on things that we haven't addressed yet? [NO]. We will send out a revised draft addressing:
 - Joint training
 - Social media
 - Make sure we are thinking of all departments, not just large
- We leave this standard and move to the Officer Wellness presentation.

Officer Wellness Presentation- Chief Balling, Sidney Police Department and President of OACP

- Important topic—thanks for allowing the discussion
- Will discuss elements that should be contained in an officer wellness standard [See PowerPoint Presentation]
- Officer deaths—focus on officer assaults, traffic incidents, but these are a small part of officer deaths
- Heart attacks 16% and suicides/mental health 43%.
- Do you think these numbers are accurate? Most say no—suicides and mental health issues are underreported.

- Average life expectancy for officer is 20 years less than civilians. Persistent stress and poor fitness is deadly.
- Persistent daily stress, anxiety over job—always on the job, exposure to human misery, difficulty managing relationships and finances.
- Gordon Graham (founder of Lexipol) “if it is predictable then it is preventable.” There are things the state can do.
- Physical wellness needs to be a holistic approach—do more than measure the Cooper standards.
- 75% of police work is ‘routine duties’
- 25% of police work is ‘high risk’
- 77% of heart attacks occur during this 25% high risk work
- ¾ of officers have high blood pressure
- Sleep is an issue—Officers tend to take more sick leave, other bad outcomes due to lack of sleep since they have odd shifts.
- Suicides—great challenge. Are at a higher risk of suicide more than any other profession. So prevalent that the number of police officers is more than triple to those who die in the line of duty.
 - Stress
 - Easy access to guns
 - Daily exposure to bad things
- Exploring the factors
 - Organizational stress—high ranking folks chief, sheriff, mayor, are often the main source of stress
 - Relationships issue
 - Nature of shift work
- Stress can be beneficial at times (fight or flight)
- Anxiety, depression, memory loss, GI issues are symptoms
- Early warning signs need to be heeded
- We need to help prevent suicides—establish programs to talk to officers, critical incident teams.
- Ohio Association of Chiefs of Police (OACP) did 2020 health and wellness survey of chiefs and sheriffs.
 - Overall wellness since becoming chief or sheriff: 35% responded their wellness was better, 35% responded their wellness was worse, 29% responded the same. Politics, stress and less structured days were identified as major factors.
 - Most chiefs and sheriffs (71%) responded that they had more stress than an officer
 - Eliminated positions, current climate, lack of support were all identified as significant stressors
 - 35% reported waking up worrying about the job
 - 64% had a critical incident in the last 5 years that affected them or their staff (on duty death of officer, officer involved shooting, officer heart attack, death/serious harm to children, bad crime scene)
 - Half said that civil unrest has affected their mental health moderately or a lot

- Over 75% felt it very or extremely important to have health and wellness programs. Needs to be supported by city hall, needs to be relatable to officers, important but must be balanced.
- OACP created a health and wellness development team. Goals to enhance officer and telecommunicator wellness, make it obtainable and beneficial for all size departments; improved service to the citizens we serve.
- Purpose of the standard: to protect the community they serve, LE employees must receive the support, resources and training necessary to maintain their own health and safety.
- Agencies shall establish a written policy explaining and outlining the benefits and importance of a total wellness program for their agency. A key to the success of this standard will be that it is obtainable by all departments and beneficial to their employees.
- Standard requirements:
 - Provide physical wellness information
 - Provide mental health information, including info on suicide awareness and prevention
 - Access to peer support and critical incident teams
 - Annual health and wellness program
 - Employee review and sign off of the policy
 - A documented annual administrative review of the agency health and wellness policy
- How to accomplish this?
 - Physical wellness info resources: access to an Employee Assistance Programs (EAP), local hospital resources, Valor, Bureau of Justice Assistance (BJA), International Association of Chiefs of Police (IACP), Destination Zero
 - Mental health info: access to Employee Assistance Programs, local Mental Health materials, state organizations like Ohio Department of Mental Health and Addiction Services (OMHAS), national sites like Valor, BJA, Destination Zero
 - Have access to a peer support team/critical incident team. We have a statewide database of existing teams that departments who do not currently have a team or do not know who to call will have access to a team. We will also have contact info for organizations who would like to join teams. Steve Click from OMHAS is putting this database together.
 - Training: besides passing out info, we want to provide physical wellness training like weight loss challenges, water consumption, and physical challenges. Mental health training like counselors speaking to staff, videos and programs, mindfulness training. Nutritional training/coaching; occupational wellness training.
 - Annual review of the policy. Are you seeing a change in our staff? Decrease in use of force, sick time? Does this standard actually improve officer health?
- Would like to have a health and wellness standard by 2021.

Questions:

- Rep. Brent—What kind of support do you need from city hall?
 - Chief Balling works for Valor. Has heard back from departments that the financial cost is a burden. Need to have discussions about cost, impact in other areas (reduced sick time, reduced use of force). Need to work with officers, union, city hall.
- Rep. Brent—Would it be beneficial to have a third party audit?

- Chief Balling - Needs to be confidential with the counselor. Info not shared with the department. The counselor is the third party. Keep separate from the city's counselors. Need to feel free to talk. Not doing things to get people OUT of the line of duty. Only a few situations in which the counselor obligated to divulge.
- Chief Balling - Some agencies claim they don't want to know if their officers have a problem.
 - Dr. Engel—Is this because of the cost of disability?
 - Chief Balling – Yes, but officer wellness is a form of preventative medicine.
- Dr. Engel –Often multiple programs put in to place at the same time. Some of the valor programs have been evaluated, but hard to tell which program is having an impact. For those who have fewer resources in place, what is the 'biggest bang for the buck'.
 - Chief Balling— It is not a one size fit all. Need to tailor the needs and resources of the agency.
- Dr. Engel —Have you seen any programs that have had unintended consequences related to stigma or anything else with regard to officer wellness?
 - Chief Balling— One city had to maintain a certain level of standards. There were about 10% of officers who did not want to do so. Created some animosity.
- Rev. Moss—What is your relationship with clergy?
 - Chief Balling – We used to have a clergy member that would ride along with officers. Now, my department has a pastoral group we meet with.
- Chief Páez— Referenced the draft of OACP sub-committee on officer wellness standard and highlighted a few important points: 1) confidentiality is an important part of the program; 2) identify Best Practices and practices that are most effective; 3) include telecommunicators.
- Sheriff Streck — Unions are concerned that incentives may start out as voluntary, but will become mandatory. How did you deal with this? Also, sheriffs may also include correctional officers in standard.
 - Chief Balling brought in a third party counselor to talk to their union. As soon as the union found out the info was not shared and there was confidentiality, they were ok with it. The union didn't want it to turn into a 'fit for duty' requirement.
- Rep. Plummer— We need to look at some of the big picture issues. Biggest thing is the retirement system because officers must work even longer now to retire. With stress and reduced life expectancy, this is a big deal.

Closing Remarks

- Assistant Director Huey made final remarks:
 - We will be scheduling a December collaborative meeting to review the Mass Gathering standard
 - With the safe policing federal order, it will require us to go back into the Use of Force standard and talk about the chokehold piece. We will send out a proposed change to the Use of Force standard.
 - Many agencies have already updated their Use of Force policy to address chokeholds.
- Karhlton Moore requested that members send their comments to him on the Mass Gathering standard by next Friday.
- Sheriff Miller and Sheriff Streck are transitioning. Assistant Director Huey thanked Sheriff Miller for all his work on the Collaborative.

Meeting concluded at 11:52.